INFLUENCE OF A MEDIATING TRANSLATION IN TRANSLATING ADDRESS FORMS IN THE MALAYALAM NOVEL, CHEMMEEN INTO FRENCH

Shyla THOMAS¹
Krishnavanie SHUNMUGAM²
R. K. SHANGEETHA³ *
¹,²,³ Faculty of Languages and Linguistics, Universiti Malaya, Kuala Lumpur

¹shyla1060@gmail.com
²krishnav@um.edu.my
³shangeetha@um.edu.my

Manuscript received 22 March 2023
Manuscript accepted 7 December 2023
*Corresponding author
https://doi.org/10.33736/ils.5555.2023

ABSTRACT

Chemmeen (1956), a Malayalam novel by Thakazhi, narrates a love story set in a Kerala fishing village. Its first English translation was done by Menon in 1962. This translation became the source text for a French translation in 1965. The French translation, being an indirect translation from Malayalam through English, largely mirrors the English version. This study focusses on how the various terms of address employed in the original Malayalam text have been translated into English and how these have influenced the French version. Newmark’s (1988) typology of translation procedures is employed to identify the procedures adopted in translating the terms of address into the mediating translation. Koller’s (1979) types of equivalence is applied to determine the types of equivalence that have been achieved and the extent that the mediating translation has influenced the French translation. The findings showed that the English translation has, for the most part, communicated the address forms by providing descriptive and functional equivalents. Nevertheless, these translations did not capture the original essence of the terms, resulting in inadequate portrayal of their cultural significance. The French version, based on the English translation, has been clearly influenced by the
mediating translation and hence also does not convey the nuances in the fishermen’s socio-cultural dimension effectively.

**Keywords:** Chemmeen; indirect translation; terms of address; mediating translation

### Introduction

The Malayalam novel, *Chemmeen*, written by Thakazhi Sivasankara Pillai (popularly known as Thakazhi) in 1956 was a best seller and recipient of the Sahitya Academy award (1965). Malayalam is the language spoken primarily by the people of Kerala, a state in the south-western part of India. *Chemmeen* reached the English reading audience when it was first translated into English by Menon and published in 1962. Menon’s (1962) English translation was done during the post-colonial period during which English translations of works in Indian languages were encouraged.

*Chemmeen* gained a worldwide presence after it was translated into Russian, Spanish, Arabic, Japanese, Vietnamese, Sinhala, and Chinese. Menon’s English translation is the mediating translation (MT) from Malayalam into French; in other words, it took on the role as a source text (ST) for Balbir (1965) to create her target translation (TT) in French. To our knowledge, the French translation is the only version that was not translated directly from Malayalam. The French translation, *Un amour indien* (1965), therefore, would have been influenced by the English translation as it was the only ST available for the translator. No records of Balbir having had access to the original Malayalam novel have been found.

Menon’s (1962) translation had many omissions, and these were mirrored in the French manuscript. Likewise, the equivalents provided for many colloquial expressions and idioms had the nuances compromised and the intensity of emotions considerably downplayed. The culture and traditions observed by the fisherman community as well as the axis on which the entire story revolves did not hold a significant position in the TT. There have been claims that Menon’s writing was titled towards gratifying the western audience’s palate and hence the nature of the English translation (Thomas, 2002).

To date, there are no significant studies on the French novel, *Un amour indien* (1965), that was translated indirectly through Menon’s (1962) English version. While existing studies do point to the fact that Menon’s translation is not a faithful representation of the original text, a more important question would be how effective the French translation is, given the fact that it was translated from English and not from the original manuscript. This presents a gap in the study of the French translation of the novel *Chemmeen*.

As an attempt to fill this gap, this study investigates the translation of the texts involved from the linguistic perspective, focusing on the terms of address involved at the familial and community level that are recorded in the Malayalam novel, *Chemmeen*, and translated by Menon into English and then into French by Balbir via English. This paper’s objective is twofold:
1. To identify the translation procedures employed in expressing the address forms in the English (which serves as a MT) and the French translations.
2. To examine the extent the MT has influenced the TT in conveying the address forms to the target audience.

Newmark’s (1988) typology of translation procedures and Koller’s (1979) type of equivalence form the basis of this paper.

**Literature Review**

**Forms of Address**

Braun (1988, p. 7) defines forms of address as “words and phrases used for addressing. They refer to the collocutor and thus contain a strong element of deixis”. Forms of address generally exist in the forms of pronoun, verb, and noun associated with words that are syntactically dependent on them. Pronouns of address are for the most part, second person pronoun “you” in English. Verb forms of address are verbs in which reference to the collocutor is expressed. Nouns of address are represented by names, kinship terms, titles that have abstract quality of address or titles of professions, terms of endearment, and terms that denote relationship, that is, the addressee’s relationship to someone else. Besides terms of address, to maintain social relationships, there are other linguistic devices such as terms of reference, honorific prefixes, and intonation patterns.

Brown and Gilman (1960) elaborate on the association of the different forms of the second person pronoun “you” with two characteristics such as power and solidarity, the two prominent dimensions that are key to the analysis of social life. Brown and Gilman propose the symbols T and V (From the Latin Tu and Vos), that refer to the two singular pronouns of address, as “… generic designators for a familiar and polite pronoun in any language” (p. 254). Dinçkan (2019), drawing from Brown and Gilman (1960), states that “the reciprocal or the non-reciprocal use of familiar and polite terms, is considered the key in understanding power and solidarity relationship” (p. 94). If a reciprocity of T forms exists between two characters, this indicates power or solidarity, but on the other hand, if the T and the V forms are non-reciprocal, there could be a power relationship. Dinçkan (2019) quotes Friedrich (1972, p. 274) who emphasises that the second person pronouns not only work independently but also in relation to other sets, including words for kinship, proper names, official ranks, words representing occupation, relative age, and other similar categories. Power and solidarity interactions are, therefore, expressed through address terms in English.

Forms of address in languages are largely culture-bound. With culture being an integral part of a language, deciding on the appropriate natural equivalents for the address terms can present an enormous task to the translators. Ethelb (2015), on studying the translation of terms of address from Arabic to English based on the novel *Ziqaq Al-
Madaq, says that terms of address are associated with significant cultural characteristics and hence there is a peril of mistranslations of cultural elements if their cultural connotations are not considered. The knowledge of the target culture would alleviate the challenges of the translation of social honorifics rather than seeking to produce their equivalent meanings.

Mansor (2018) examines the translation of the English pronoun “you” to its Malay equivalent in the first episode of Grey’s Anatomy, a famous American medical drama series. English has just one form of you when addressing people whereas the Malay language has several alternatives. Malay has awak, kau, engkau, kamu, anda and a few others such as hang, mu, kitak, and demo that are dialect forms. The appropriate usage of the terms is important, and it depends on factors such as the age of the addressee and the sort of relationship shared. Mansor quotes Morin (2005), who suggests that:

the differences in pronominal systems, proper names and also kinship terms of both source and target languages can affect the translation process. Issues in translating linguistic elements ... occur when their meaning determined on the basis of the use the receptor language and not on the basis of the form in the source language. This can be observed in the translation of the English pronoun “you” into Indonesian. Indonesian differentiates two forms of second person pronoun: familiar “bapa”, “ibu”, “saudara” and formal “you” when translating from English to Indonesian but the reverse is not possible as English does not have an equivalent for familiar and formal second person pronoun. (p. 70)

Indirect Translation (ITr)

Rosa et al. (2017) state that indirect translation (ITr), that is, a translation of a translation, has a long history. The Bible and Shakespearean translations are typically considered as familiar examples. Despite this, ITr has received little attention from translation scholars. It is only recently that works in this field has started to gain significant traction in the Translation Studies (TS) domain. Rosa et al. list several definitions of ITr from previous researchers. In general, ITr is described as a product that is “based on a source (or sources) which is itself a translation into a language other than the language of the original, or the target language” (Rosa et al., 2017, p. 119).

Indirect translation is also distinct from other types of translation, such as support translations and relay translations. ITrs are considered as intermediate translations that are not intended for consumption. Meanwhile, support translations involve same-text translations into other target systems and relay translations are intermediate translations meant for a readership (Dollerup, 2000, as cited in Washbourne, 2013). Relay translation involves moving the source from the periphery into relative centrality into a language from which more translations are produced (Washbourne, 2013).

Based on the definition by Kittel and Frank (1991) and by Pym (2011), it can be understood that ITr basically involves: (1) one source text (ST), in one source language (SL)
and one source culture, (2) a first translated text in a second language which is a mediating text (MT) and a mediating language (ML) within a second national culture, and (3) a second translated text in a third language which becomes the ultimate target text (TT) and the ultimate target language (TL) located within a third national culture (Rosa et al., 2017).

Among the main reasons why ITrs occur are the lack of knowledge or lack of translators working in the pair, relative prestige of the languages involved, or even copyright and authorial control (Washbourne, 2013). According to research on Swedish translations done during the period from year 2000 to 2015, 70 of the 5,259 translated novels during this time were ITrs (Allwood, 2021). It was also observed that 48 of the 70 cases of ITr that were identified (or 68.5% of all ITrs) employed English as the ML for the purpose of translating the novels into modern Swedish. French, German, Russian, Spanish, Dutch, and Turkish were other languages that have been employed as mediating languages, listed in decreasing order. Although French and German were the most prevalent MLs after English, other, more peripheral languages might also serve as the ML.

Some researchers assert that the changes that occur during indirect translation, whether in the form of errors carried over from the MT or in the form of changes made by the translator while translating from the MT, point to the fact that changes can happen during the first phase of the transfer, that is, from the ST to the MT, and/or it may also occur in the subsequent phase of the transfer, that is, from the MT to the TT (Haroon, 2022). With regard to literary texts, it was found that more changes are typically made in the first link of the ITr chain, frequently resulting in a situation where the ultimate target text is a fairly faithful rendering of the MT, but the MT is a relatively unfaithful version of the ultimate ST (Pieta, 2019, in Haroon, 2022). Haroon (2022, p. 170) observes that “… when the fidelity of the mediating text to the source text is compromised, this has a spillover effect on the target text in that the target text becomes more dissimilar to the original source text”. This could be because of unequal power relations between the languages involved.

In an ITr, the translation would largely depend on the MT that acts as the ST for the target audience. Heavy reliance on the MT is bound to happen when the target translator has near zero knowledge of the source culture and language and only one translation to base his/her version on. This would generally lead the translator to faithfully mirror the translation strategies employed by the producer of the MT.

Methodology

This study focuses on words and phrases from the Malayalam novel Chemmeen that express terms of address and reference, used within the family and community including those of abuse and disrespect. All the terms of address from the source text were identified and used for this study. The terms were categorised based on the power and solidarity relationship proposed by Brown and Gilman (1960). Following the approach of Dinçkan (2019), the data for this study were based on the type of interactions between
the characters involved in the novel. The questions that were asked for the purpose of
categorisation were:

1. How do the family members address each other?
2. How do general acquaintances address each other?
3. How do strangers address each other?

Based on the questions, the terms of address were categorised as follows:

1. Kinship terms
2. Kinship terms extended to communal relationships
3. Terms of reference/address specific to fisherman dialect
4. Terms that signify a special social standing
5. Disrespectful terms of address
6. Terms of abuse

Following the six categories, the Malayalam terms, their meaning, English and
French translations taken from the corresponding texts, and the translation procedures
adopted were tabulated. The context of the term, its significance, and implication were
explained. The procedures adopted by Menon (1962) to convey an equivalent term in
English were explored in the light of Newmark’s (1988) list of translation procedures.
Next, the same terms of address in the French version were examined to determine
whether they have been influenced by the MT or otherwise, that is, to check if the same
procedure has been adopted by way of translation in the TT. The effectiveness of the
procedure in bringing out the meaning as intended by the ST author is studied both in the
MT as well as in the TT. This would indicate the degree to which the MT has influenced
the TT given the fact that the French TT is based on the English manuscript as a source.
The type of equivalence achieved in the MT and the TT was also discussed, based on
Koller’s (1979) type of equivalence.

**Newmark’s (1988) Typology of Translation Procedures**

The identification of the translation procedures was carried out with reference to
enumerates a list of translation procedures that are adopted for the translation of
sentences and smaller units of language, as follows:

- **Transference:** This covers processes such as loanword, *emprunt*, transcription
  and transliteration. It is a general practice that culture-specific words in regional
  novels are transferred with the objective of adding local flavour, promoting
  closeness with the text and reader.
- **Naturalisation:** This is a step beyond transference, and it consists of first adapting
  the SL word to the normal pronunciation and then to the word form of the TL.
- **Cultural equivalent:** A cultural word in the SL is translated by a cultural word in
  the TL.
• Functional equivalent: This deals with a culture-free word to translate a cultural word in the SL with the help of a new specific term. This procedure of deculturalising a cultural word, that is, a cultural componential analysis is the most accurate way of translating a cultural word.

• Descriptive equivalent: This procedure involves giving a description of the word to be translated.

• Synonymy: This is employing the near TL equivalent to an SL word in rare situations where there is no clearcut equivalence in the TL.

• Through-translation: This is the term that Newmark (1988) adopts for calque or loan translation by which names of organisations and common collocations get literally translated.

• Recognised translation: This means that only authorised or generally accepted translation of any institutional term must be used. The translation allows it to be glossed when appropriate.

• Translation label: This procedure allows the term to be within inverted commas and is done through literal translation.

• Compensation: This occurs when loss of meaning in one part is compensated in another part of the sentence.

• Componential analysis: This refers to the procedure of breaking up of a lexical unit into its sense components, one to two, three or four translations.

• Reduction and expansion: These procedures are categorised as imprecise translation procedures that one may use intuitively in some cases and ad hoc in certain other cases.

• Paraphrase: This procedure aims at explaining the meaning of a segment of the text. This is generally used in poorly written texts or texts that have important implications and omissions.

**Types of Equivalence**

There are five frames of equivalence relations that are used for the current study, based on Koller (1979, as cited in Pym, 2014, p. 17). These are given as follows:

- Denotative (based on extra-linguistic factors)
- Connotative (based on way the source text is expressed)
- Text-normative (respecting or changing textual and linguistic norms)
- Pragmatic (with respect to the receiver of the target text)
- Formal (the formal-aesthetic qualities of the source text)

These categories are utilised by the translator to choose the kind of equivalence best suited for the dominating function in the source text. Pym (2014, p. 46) adds that according to Koller (1979), “the way you translate (the kinds of equivalence you seek) depends on the function of the text or fragment you are translating”. Therefore, if a poem...
primarily functions at the level of form, one must look for equivalence primarily at the
level of form.

Results and Discussion

Kinship Terms

The Keralite culture, like other Indian states, values familial relationships and hence
places a lot of importance on addressing one another in the family using specific forms of
address, which considers the age and gender of the addressees. Table 1 shows
the forms of address used at the familial level in the ST and their English and French translations.

Table 1
Terms of Kinship, Their Translation, and Procedure Adopted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No.</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>MT</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Translation procedure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Ichechi</td>
<td>Older sister</td>
<td>Karuthamma</td>
<td>Karuthamma</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Chettan</td>
<td>Brother in-law</td>
<td>Palani</td>
<td>Palani</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Amma/</td>
<td>Mother</td>
<td>Mummy</td>
<td>Maman/Mère</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ammaachi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Achan/</td>
<td>Father</td>
<td>Father</td>
<td>Père</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Achaan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the ST, the female protagonist Karuthamma is referred to and addressed by
her younger sister as *Ichechi. Chechi*, that refers to an older sister, in the fisherman
dialect, has been modified as *Ichechi. Chettan* in Malayalam language can be used to
address an older brother, a brother-in-law, or an older male cousin. Addressing or
referring to an older person by his/her name is considered rude in the Keralite tradition.
Menon’s (1962) English translation of these terms involves using the names of these
people, which are Karuthamma and Palani. As the English text serves as the ST for the
French version, Balbir too adopts the names in her translation. Likewise, the terms *amma*
or *ammanachi* used to address one’s mother and *Achan* to address father have been
translated as *Mummy* and *Father* in the MT and hence they have been reflected in the TT
as *mère/maman* and *père* respectively.

Menon’s (1962) strategy of supplying a cultural equivalent for kinship terms in
English creates a sense of “Englishness” to the Malayali (Malayalam-speaking) family and
the relationships involved. The English translation of the kinship terms have achieved denotative equivalence in the sense that they convey the relationship between the speakers of the conversation but the cultural significance that is intertwined with the terms is absent in the TT that has mirrored the MT.

**Kinship Terms Extended to Communal Relationships**

The Keralites regard the community as an extension of their families, and therefore, it is not unusual to hear a Keralite person addressing a person in public sphere not by their name but *Chetta* or *Chechi* (older brother/older sister) out of respect. This unique cultural form of address may take a westerner by surprise but is considered a polite form to the Keralites. This kind of address is perceived as a means to form good relations with people of the community. Table 2 lists the kinship terms used in communal living found in the ST and their English and French translations.

### Table 2
**Terms of Communal Living, Their Translation, and Procedure Adopted**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No.</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>MT</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Translation procedure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Chettan</td>
<td>Older brother</td>
<td>Achakunju</td>
<td>Achakounju</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Chedathy</td>
<td>Older sister</td>
<td>Chakki</td>
<td>Chakki</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Pengal</td>
<td>Older sister</td>
<td>Chakki</td>
<td>Chakki</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Kochan</td>
<td>Child</td>
<td>Boy</td>
<td>Garçon</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Kochamma</td>
<td>Aunt</td>
<td>Auntie</td>
<td>Tante</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An older male, out of respect, is addressed as *Chetta* (*Chettan*) in the Keralite community. Similarly, an older female can be referred to as *Chechi, Chedathy,* or *Pengal.* These terms in the novel *Chemmeen* have been replaced by their respective terms in the English MT (Achakunju, Chakki) and therefore, in the French TT too.

Menon (1962) has supplied the cultural equivalents for the address terms that relate to communal living in the MT and consequently, the TT has them too. The translated terms have achieved denotative equivalence as they communicate the content involved in those situations. However, as their connotative and pragmatic equivalents are
not achieved, the cultural significance that is embedded in the usage of the Malayalam terms of address does not get across to the foreign audience. This may affect the context comprehension, which in turn influence the audience’s reading pleasure, as the nuances in the story that can be recognised with the appropriate usage of the terms of address in certain contexts have not been captured.

**Terms of Reference Specific to Fisherman Dialect**

The community in the novel *Chemmeen*, that is, the fisherman community, has their own specific dialect, which Thakazhi employs. These are listed in Table 3.

**Table 3**

*Terms of Fisherman Dialect, Their Translation, and Procedure Adopted*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>MT</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Translation procedure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Marakkan</td>
<td>Fisherman</td>
<td>fisherman</td>
<td>Pêcheur</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Marakkathi</td>
<td>Wife/Fisherwoman</td>
<td>Wife</td>
<td>Femme</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Chakki Marakkathi</td>
<td>Chakki</td>
<td>Chakki</td>
<td>Chakki</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Ende Marakkan</td>
<td>My husband</td>
<td>My husband</td>
<td>Mon mari</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Kadalamma</td>
<td>Sea mother</td>
<td>Goddess of the sea</td>
<td>La déesse de la mer</td>
<td>Functional equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Naalaam Vedhakkaaran</td>
<td>A Muslim person</td>
<td>Not a fisherman</td>
<td>Ce n’est pas un pêcheur</td>
<td>Descriptive equivalent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Marakkan* is a term used to refer to a fisherman, more specifically to refer to the class of fishermen who go into the sea to catch fish for their livelihood. The feminine form of this word is *Marakkathi*, which could mean a fisherwoman or the wife of a fisherman. Menon (1962) provides the cultural equivalent of *Marakkan as fisherman* and hence the French version calls it *pêcheur* (which means *fisherman*). The term *Marakkathi* too has not been retained in the MT, instead it has been translated as *wife* and the French TT records it as *femme* (which means *wife*).
A respectful way of referring to a fellow fisherwoman, especially from a man, would be to use the name of the woman before adding Marakkathi to it. For instance, Chakki, the mother of Karuthamma, was referred to as Chakki Marakkathi by Pareekutty in the original Malayalam novel. It is rendered in the English and French translations as Chakki.

The female protagonist refers to her husband as Ende marakkan which means my husband (literally meaning my fisherman). Menon (1962) has translated it as my husband and Balbir as mon mari (which means my husband) in French.

To the fishermen, the sea is their deity and a mother-figure to them because the sea is their provider. They refer to this deity as Kadalamma, which literally means Sea Mother. This term is translated by Menon (1962) as goddess of the sea as the western audience may already be familiar with India’s pluralistic religious practices. Menon’s goddess of the sea and Balbir’s la déesse de la mer (that means goddess of the sea), being functional equivalents, do convey a divine aspect of the sea but do not, however, portray the sea as a mother to the fisherfolk.

The fisherman community refers to Muslims as Naalaam Vedhakkaaran, literally meaning the one who embraces the 4th Veda or sacred writing. Although the fishermen, predominantly Hindus, treat Muslims with little sense of belonging and togetherness, this term Naalaam Vedhakkaaran is certainly not used with disrespect. Menon (1962) adopts the procedure of providing a descriptive equivalent to this term in the MT as Not a fisherman and Balbir translates this term literally as Ce n’est pas un pêcheur (which means that is not a fisherman). This sort of description is sought for the part when the mother advises Karuthamma about the purity of the women who will safeguard the community against the wrath of Kadalamma, their deity. The mother uses discrimination to warn that the Muslims (Naalaam Vedhakkaaran) may not be interested in the religious beliefs that the fishermen practise and hence warns her daughter to be “pure”, dissuading her from seeing her boyfriend, who is a Muslim. The translations manage to convey a discriminatory term, but the foreign audience are not adequately informed of who the “non fisherman” is in the given context and the reason for discrimination. Besides, the term Naalaam Vedhakkaaran, that is exclusively used by the Keralite fishing community to refer to Muslims, remains unknown to them.

The SL terms such as Marakkan, Marakkathi, Chakki Marakkathi, and Ende Marakkan have been given the cultural equivalent in the MT. The SL terms such as Kadalamma and Naalam Vedhakkaaran have been given the functional and descriptive equivalents respectively in the MT. The translation of all the terms in this category have achieved denotative equivalence but not connotative equivalence. Consequently, the MT is not able to present to the readers the traditional values and beliefs of the fisherman, elements that forms the core of the novel. The French TT, a close representation of the MT, is unable to carry these significant elements to the foreign audience as well.
Terms that Signify a Special Social Standing

The fisherman community recognises certain terms that are used as titles or forms of reference among their people. These terms, shown in Table 4, are attributed to people based on their socio-economic standard, caste, or leadership position.

Table 4
Terms of Social Standing, Their Translation, and Procedure Adopted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>MT</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Translation procedure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Mothalali</td>
<td>Merchant</td>
<td>Mothalali</td>
<td>Mothalali</td>
<td>Transference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Kochumuthalali</td>
<td>Junior Merchant</td>
<td>Kochumuthalali</td>
<td>Kochoumouthalali</td>
<td>Transference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Achan</td>
<td>Village head</td>
<td>Father</td>
<td>Père</td>
<td>Functional equivalent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mothalali* literally means *owner* but in the fishing community described in the ST, *Mothalali* refers to the merchant who trades fish. *Kochumuthalali* (literally meaning *small* or *junior merchant*) is used to refer to the merchant’s son who carries on the business of his father. By way of employing transference (loanword), Menon (1962) has retained both the words *Mothalali* and *Kochumuthalali* in his English translation. This is followed by Balbir as well in her French version as *Mouthalali* and *Kochoumouthalali*. Retaining these terms in both the MT as well as TT help to showcase a dimension of the fisherman culture and contributes to preserving the local colour.

The village head is addressed as *Achan*. This word sounds the same as the one for *father*, but it is different in the Malayalam written form. Menon (1962) translates it as *father*, possibly as *Achan* being their head, the fishermen look up to him and respect him as one would do to their father in a family. The denotative equivalence achieved in the translation of *Achan* to ‘father’ has been mirrored in the TT as *père*.

This functional equivalent in the French version is also *père*, this being the literal translation of *father*. While the terms *father* and *père* may serve to indicate the village head in the translations, the unique term that the entire community adopts to address their village head, i.e., a culture-specific one, is not conveyed to the non-Malayali readers. Besides, the term does not evoke the respectful sentiment that the fishermen have towards their village head.
**Disrespectful Terms of Address**

Besides polite terms, the Keralite culture also possesses terms of address that include abuse words and disrespectful terms. These are employed at the familial and community levels. Disrespectful words comprise of ordinary, day-to-day words, and names of animals. Table 5 lists the disrespectful words found in the ST.

**Table 5**
*Terms of Disrespect, Their Translation, and Procedure Adopted*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No.</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>MT</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Translation procedure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Methan</td>
<td>A Muslim person</td>
<td>Pareekutty</td>
<td>Parikoutti</td>
<td>Functional equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Thendigal</td>
<td>Beggars</td>
<td>Vagrants</td>
<td>Mendiant</td>
<td>Literal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Thuppalukudiy</td>
<td>A Stingy person</td>
<td>Miser</td>
<td>Avare</td>
<td>Functional equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Kaalamaadan</td>
<td>God of death</td>
<td>Father of yours</td>
<td>Ton père</td>
<td>Descriptive equivalent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A Muslim individual is generally referred to as *Naalam vedhakkaran* by the fishing community but the same term changes to *Methan* if the speaker decides to use a disrespectful form. In the novel *Chemmeen*, Palani refers to Pareekutty, a Muslim, as *Methan* in a disrespectful manner as he was his wife’s former boyfriend. Menon (1962) translates *Methan* as *Pareekutty*, referring to him just by his name. The French translation, following the MT, calls him *Parikoutti*. *Methan* is a rude term that is offensive and discriminatory and therefore, the foreign reader does not get to know the intensity of the emotions involved and hence their understanding of the story may be altered as well.

The term *Thendi* (the plural form being *Thendigal*) literally means a *beggar*, one who goes from house to house or to people begging for food, clothes, or money. In the ST, the village head chides the bridegroom’s people for not being able to pay the set sum of dowry, calling them *Thendigal*. He does not intend its literal meaning but conveys his annoyance and contempt for them through the word. The MT calls it *Vagrants* and the French translator *Mendiants*, both of which amount to poor, homeless people, the original literal meaning. Lowering their standard is the intention of the village head when he uses the term *Thendigal*. The literal translation does convey the village head’s anger by the term of insult he employs but the distinct meaning and the intensity of the disrespectful term do not get carried to the foreign readers.
Thuppalukudiyan is a term in Malayalam used to refer to people who are overly stingy or miserly. It literally means Spit-drinker, thuppal meaning spit and kudiyan is one who drinks. Menon (1962) calls Chembankunju a miser and the French translation avare, adopting functional equivalence. While the terms “miser” and “avare” inform the foreign readers that Chembankunju is a miser, the translation does not evoke the crudity of the term Thuppalukudiyan. The term is unique to the language and culture as it is made of everyday elements and reflects the standard of simple fisherfolk who do not have refined ways of speaking.

Thakazhi uses the word Kaalamaadan in his novel to let Chakki express her anger towards her proud and greedy husband. She refers to him as Kaalamaadan while speaking to her daughter. The word Kaalamaadan literally means the god of death, one who does not let people live on. Menon (1962) renders its descriptive equivalent in his translation as that father of yours and Balbir translates it as ton père (your father). Menon, as with other crude terms, has chosen to gloss over the term Kaalamaadan, too. This is possibly because his translation was mainly meant for a western audience, and to render a suitable context, he chooses to soften the crude-sounding and disrespectful terms. As such, the MT and the TT, in this context, do not adequately portray the scenario to the readers as neither the character’s avaricious nature nor the disappointment blended with anger and grief in Chakki’s tone are conveyed to them.

In the translation of the terms in this category, the denotative equivalence of the terms has been achieved in the MT and hence in the TT as it follows the MT. However, the absence of connotative equivalence means that the intensity of the sentiments involved in the contexts in question may not be successfully conveyed to the foreign readers.

Terms of Abuse

Keralites’ terms of abuse may spell religious discrimination. Metaphors, as well, form offensive interpretations. Therefore, it is common to hear people using figurative language to convey abuse in Malayalam. Table 6 lists the various terms of abuse that have been taken from the ST.

Methan Kazhuveran is a very strong word, abusive in nature, in Malayalam. As Kazhuveran is added to a person’s name or nick name, it is added to the word Methan meaning Muslim. Kazhu refers to the tree where people were made to hang from, and therefore, kazhuveran means that someone should be sent to the tree to be hanged to their death.

In the ST, Pareekutty is referred to as Methan Kazhuveran as Palani, ‘his rival’, is overwhelmingly distraught by his actions. Menon adopts the procedure of cultural componential analysis that Newmark (1988) describes as “deculturalising a cultural word” (p.83), rendering it as the devil and in French le diable (The devil). The discriminatory element Methan is entirely avoided in this case. Devil and diable may convey Palani’s anger and grief to the foreign readers but the translations do not present the social and
cultural dimensions involved, such as the discrimination based on religions and the uniqueness of the abuse word.

Table 6
Terms of Abuse, Their Translation, and Procedure Adopted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No.</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>MT</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Translation procedure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Methan kazhuveran</td>
<td>A Muslim person</td>
<td>Devil</td>
<td>Le diable</td>
<td>Componential analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Choole</td>
<td>Broom</td>
<td>He swore at her</td>
<td>Il se mit à jurer</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Pezhachaval</td>
<td>A defiled woman</td>
<td>A bad woman</td>
<td>Une mauvaise femme</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Nayinde mone</td>
<td>Son of a bitch</td>
<td>Dog</td>
<td>Chien</td>
<td>Cultural equivalent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Chool* refers to a “broom” in Malayalam, and *Choole* is the term when it is used to call a person. Calling a person *Choole* is considered offensive. It is commonly remarked in the Indian culture that someone holding a broom is a sure sign of bad omen and is believed to bring bad luck if one happens to see it while setting out on a journey or an assignment. *Chembankunju* dismisses his wife’s wisdom when she tries to challenge him by calling her *Choole* in the early section of the novel. Through this, Thakazhi sets the stage for the readers to understand the male-dominated society of that era and hence the superiority of the husband over his wife (the wife does not reciprocate his action in the novel). Menon (1962) translates the phrase as *he swore at her* and Balbir translates it as *il se mit à jurer* (He began to curse) following the MT. The act of swearing is something that the western audience might identify themselves with. The English translator’s choice of *he swore at her* and its French translation *il se mit à jurer* may serve to portray the man’s anger but does not fully reflect the superiority of the man over his wife. The crude language of the fisherman who hurls at her words such as *Choole* remains unknown to the foreign readers.

*Pezhachaval* is a word in the Malayalam language to describe an immoral woman that is packed with crudity. This term gains more currency in the novel *Chemmeen* because the fidelity of a woman to her husband is shown as the sole factor that determines his safe return from the sea and its rough life. This issue of marital faithfulness
is the pivotal issue in the novel, anchoring the entire story. Menon’s (1962) translation of pezhachaval, a bad woman, referring to Karuthamma, presents little derogatory connotation. A bad woman is a generic term and could be a blanket term to refer to someone with many vices but not specifically a person with sexual promiscuity. Balbir translates a bad woman in French as une mauvaise femme, which means the same as in English, and therefore lacks the punch of the original swear word.

Nayinde mone is a term of abuse in the Malayalam language resonating with vulgarity and coarseness as the literal meaning of it is son of a bitch. In the novel Chemmeen, one of the boatmen, when pushed to the limits, calls Palani Nayinde mone, which Menon translates as dog. Dog and chien in the French translation are certainly abusive in nature, aimed at someone to show disgust or other negative feelings, but are far from degrading their mother’s moral standards which the term nayinde mone strongly evokes.

The lack of connotative equivalence and the formal equivalence in the translation of these terms in the discussed categories would have influenced the readers’ appreciation of the story. The translated words sound neutral, and being devoid of crudity, they do not convey the cultural dimension of the fisherman society that Thakazhi portrayed in the ST. Besides, the fine nuances that the terms of address create in the story are missed by the foreign readers.

Conclusion

The analysis sheds light on the type of translation procedures that were used to translate the various terms of address that the characters use in the novel. It was found that Menon (1962), for most part, has chosen not to retain the culture-specific terms of address in his English translation. Instead, he provided cultural or descriptive equivalents of the terms. These have resulted in the loss of cultural significance of Keralites in general and the fishermen more specifically. Consequently, the depth of the sentiments may not be adequately experienced by the target audience. Furthermore, the crude and abusive terms of address that are reflective of the socio-cultural standard of the Keralite fisherman society of the 1960s have been glossed over, resulting in the loss of deeper evoked meanings of the fisherfolk dialect. All of these have been mirrored in the TT as well, following the MT as its ST. In terms of equivalence, for the most part, denotative equivalence of the terms was met, and this was closely followed by the TT as well. This study has made evident that the MT has exerted a strong influence on how the address forms in the French version Un amour indien are conveyed. Even though the findings of this study are based on the novel Chemmeen, an important overall implication is the crucial role an MT plays in producing subsequent translations. If subsequent translations are to reflect the cultural uniqueness of the source culture, the distinct writing style of the original author, and the impact of the story woven together with various emotions and innuendos, then the MT must first strive to reach these translation heights. In other words, the extent to which the MT of a literary text closely documents the cultural
nuances of the ST would influence the extent of the reflectiveness of the “genius” or strength of the original work, affecting the depth of experience of the foreign culture by the receiving culture. If the MT of a literary text is a gist translation or a “transparent” one, then the readership merely gets a quick read of the narrative with a lot of aesthetics being left out from the storytelling. From the analysis in this study, clearly, terms of address constitute an integral part of cultural aesthetics, and therefore should be treated as a vital part when interpreting a story.

References


