REVIEW PAPER

A Brief Review of the Nutritive Value and Chemical Components of Bat Guano and Its Potential Use as a Natural Fertiliser in Agriculture

SITI-SYAMIM NURFATIHAH ABD RAHMAN*¹, ROBERTA CHAYA TAWIE TINGGA², MOHAMAD FHAIZAL MOHAMAD BUKHORI² & SHARIFAH MONA ABD AZIZ ABDULLAH²

¹Faculty of Resource Science and Technology, Universiti Malaysia Sarawak, 94300, Kota Samarahan, Sarawak, Malaysia; ²Centre for Pre-University Studies, Universiti Malaysia Sarawak, 94300, Kota Samarahan, Sarawak,

Malaysia

*Corresponding author: sitisyamim98@gmail.com

Received: 31 October 2022 Accepted: 20 March 2023 Published: 30 June 2023

ABSTRACT

New and improved fertilisers are constantly being introduced to the market to help increase crop yields. However, the common usage of chemical fertilisers had brought upon negative impacts to the environment and the study for sustainable fertiliser is still ongoing. This review will highlight the usage of bat guano as a valuable fertiliser which has a potential to diminish the effects of chemical fertiliser usage, increase yield and is cost effective. Its role as a fertiliser can support the agricultural growth and in turn provides additional care for plants. The chemical compositions of guano which was found to be subpar with other fertilisers support its usage of guano as an alternative for crop yield enhancement. Plant growth performance that shows a significant positive impact of guano on crops, further demonstrates its usage as organic fertilisers. In-depth study of the chemical composition of guano should be pursued as the fertiliser has high beneficial value to the ecology and economy.

Keywords: Bat guano, chemical composition, fertiliser, manure, plant growth

Copyright: This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the CC-BY-NC-SA (Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License) which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, for non-commercial purposes, provided the original work of the author(s) is properly cited.

INTRODUCTION

Plant growth is highly dependent on the plants' physical, chemical, and biological properties. Enhancement of these properties can be carried out by adding plant regulators or fertilisers (Bender et al., 1998). Generally, fertilisers can be classified as organic or chemical. Using fertilisers is important in agricultural production for increment of plant growth efficiency (Karagoz-Sezer & Hanaya, 2020). The significance of agriculture to fulfil the food supply of this ever-growing population has caused farmers to opt out from the environmentally friendly plantation techniques (Fernandez et al., 2003). Fertiliser industry had brought over extensive usage of chemical fertilisers worldwide. This is because the chemical fertilisers option was inexpensive and apparently, gave a faster result in yielding production (Kincheloe, 1983).

According to Oo et al. (2019), chemical fertilisers (inorganic or synthetic) are defined as

artificial chemicals containing primary nutrients for plants such as nitrogen (N), phosphorus (P), and potassium (K) in laboratories. Organic fertilisers on the other hand are fertilisers derived from organic matter that was collected from nature (plant or animal waste) making up to green manure, livestock manure or compost (Demirtas *et al.*, 2005).

Application of organic fertilisers such as compost, green manure and bioinoculants are a vital procedure in organic farming management (Thampan, 1993). Organic fertilisers provide constant availability of nutrients and an equal uptake by plants; hence, rainwater does not leach the nutrients away (Linn & Myint, 2018; Oo *et al.*, 2019). In addition, organic fertilisers play a role in decreasing greenhouse effect and global warming as it is able to isolate more carbon in the soil (Assefa & Tadesse, 2019). Several animal-derived fertilisers such as chicken manure and cow dung are one of the best organic fertilisers as they provide an eminent source of N, P, K, and other organic matter to the soil (Oo *et al.*, 2019). Bat guano can be defined as the excretion matter of bats (Sakoui *et al.*, 2020).

Torres-Jimenez *et al.* (2020) stated that guano provides a great alternative for fertilisers, when compared among other organic fertilisers. Based on previous studies, bat guano is known to be the best fertiliser worldwide because it contains high levels of N and K (Hutchinson, 1950; Kasso & Balakhrishnan, 2013; Sakoui *et al.*, 2020). It is a better alternative when compared to a synthetic fertiliser as it does not contain nutrient residue (Diba *et al.*, 2013). However, surveys done by Kingston *et al.* (2006), noted that only 3.4% of communities in Malaysia were aware of bat guano's usage for crops fertilisers. Therefore, it is important to shed a light on the importance of bat guano as fertiliser through this review.

BAT GUANO

Being the second largest group in Class Mammalia, bats (Order: Chiroptera) accommodates approximately 1,232 species taxonomically identified worldwide (Nowak, 1994; Simmons, 2005; Ghanem & Voigt, 2012; Fenton & Simmons, 2015; Sakoui et al., 2020; Torres-Jimenez et al., 2020). Bats are distributed throughout each continent except in some remote oceanic islands and polar regions such as Antarctica (Ghanem & Voigt, 2012; Sakoui et al. 2020). Diversity of bats particularly in tropical regions (Simmons & Voss, 1998; Bass et al., 2010; Ghanem & Voigt, 2012), occurs because of its variety of diets, which is brought by evolution through adaptation and speciation suited for their habitat environment (Voigt & Kingston, 2016; Torres-Jimenez et al., 2020). The diet consists of frugivorous, insectivorous, nectarivorous, sanguivorous and carnivorous (Ferreira, 2019; Torres-Jimenez et al., 2020). The variety of roost habitats of bats include mines, cave and tree cavities, crevices, and branches. Heterothermic bat species prefers cave areas for roosting to breed and hibernate (Sakoui et al., 2020). Cave roosts that accommodate huge bat colonies (thousands of bats individuals), are the main provider of guano, which is an important biomass to the ecosystem (Ghanem & Voigt, 2012; Kasso & Balakhrishnan, 2013; Voigt & Kingston, 2016; Torres-Jimenez et al., 2020).

Sridhar et al. (2006) and Shetty et al. (2013) recorded the morphological characteristics of

insectivorous guano as an elongated blackish brown and grey fecal pellet with rough surface. The length or size of the fecal pellets in both studies differs where a size of 9 to 11 mm was measured in Shetty et al. (2013) while a 3.5 to 6 mm was measured in Sridhar et al. (2006). Ware et al. (2020) mentioned that the morphology of guano may be more closely related to the bats' diet than its species, which can be vital in identifying the prey taxa to bring focus on conservation strategies. Composition of guano differs depending on the diet of the bat species (Ferreira, 2019). This is also supported by Karagoz (2014) which also brings to light about the influence of the guano region on the composition of guano.

As a result of the pungent odour produced from the guano that attracts invertebrates, guano also supports the cave ecosystem for diverse organisms of cave inhibitors such as insects, bacteria, and fungi (Harris, 1970; Sridhar et al., 2006; Emerson & Roark, 2007; Ghanem & Voigt, 2012; Kasso & Balakhrishnan, 2013). Ferreira and Martin (1998) reported that the invertebrate diversity that inhabits the guano, particularly in dry tropical caves, is dependent on the diet of the bat that produced it (Emerson & Roark, 2007). The physical and chemical properties of guano also vary at different habitats and at different times (Ferreira & Martins, 1999; Newman et al., 2018). Further, guano serves as the energy source of the cave ecosystem in temperate regions (Ghanem & Voigt, 2012).

In agricultural aspects, recently, an increase of studies on the beneficial effects of guano on plant growth have been observed (Grantina-Ievina & Ievinsh, 2015). Since long ago, guano had been extracted from caves to be utilised as fertilisers because of its high nutrient levels (Kasso & Balakhrishnan, 2013). This study reported that a high number of guano products have been in demand on the market sales. It was recorded to be one of the world's finest organic fertilisers as it improves the quality and increases the production of plants because of its nutrient levels (Tuttle & Moreno, 2005; Yankova *et al.*, 2016).

BAT GUANO IN BORNEO

Bat guano have been discovered in many caves worldwide and have been exploited commercially as manure because of its high nutrient levels (Sridhar et al., 2006; Kasso & Balakhrishnan, 2013). It was reported that since the 19th century, more than 100,000 tonnes of guano have been exploited around the United States to be used as fertilisers (Ghanem & Voigt, 2012). In the past, there were a handful of countries that collected guano for fertiliser such as United States, Cuba, Mexico, Jamaica, Brazil, Cambodia, Thailand, and Indonesia (Ghanem & Voigt, 2012; Sothearen et al., 2014; Ferreira, 2019). Harvesting of bat guano can be done in various methods, some research of bat guano was done with samples obtained from a direct collection of guano piles from cave floors (Bird et al., 2007; Wurster et al., 2015; Wasti et al., 2021). Other methods of collections were through a placement of plastic tarps or plates directly underneath bat roosts identified in the cave (McFarlane et al., 2017). In Vietnam, bat guano harvesting was done through the construction of bat houses. The guano collected were sourced economically into the fertilisers market and the profits were collected by the owner which calculated to be a monthly average of 50 USD/bat house (Nguyen, 2015).

Due to the stable climate of tropical countries such as Brazil, the availability of guano is constant as there is no migration or hibernation of bats which corresponds to temperate regions (Ferreira, 2019). Considering the matter, it is vital for the tropical country of Malaysia to study in depth on the qualities of bat guano. In Malaysia, bat guano had been discovered in several localities particularly in Borneo. Findings by McFarlane and Lundberg (2018) of bat guano in caves in Sarawak areas: Racer Cave, Mulu National Park and Niah Cave found the presence of multiple minerals associated with the bat guano such as nitrate, phosphate and sulphate. Studies by Wurster et al. (2015) on the biogeochemistry on guano from insectivorous bats can be obtained from guano samples in limestone caves located around Malaysia which are Batu Cave in Peninsular Malaysia, Niah Cave and Gomantong Cave in Northern Borneo as well as Makangit and Gangub Cave located in the Phillipines.

Another research on bat guano conducted in Southern Borneo used the bat guano as radiocarbon dating to provide records of environmental changes (Wurster *et al.*, 2019). Wurster *et al.* (2019) utilised the radiocarbon dating methods in their effort to prove the presence of a savanna ecosystem in Borneo during Pleistocene epoch. Most recent findings on bat guano in Malaysia is centred on the host properties of the guano for SARS-CoV. In the wake of the Coronavirus pandemic, virology surveillances and studies had been widely throughout Asia. conducted In Borneo specifically, studies conducted by Tan et al. (2021) in Wind Cave Nature Reserve, Bau, Sarawak, found a high diversity of alpha and beta coronaviruses which are unique to Borneo Island. Regarding the field of mycology, guano obtained from Madai Cave, Sabah were found to contain 32 species of fungi such as Penicillium spp., Aspergillus spp. and Purpureocillium lilnacium (Wasti et al., 2021). Based on previous studies in the matter of bat guano, it is clear that studies referring to bat guano properties specifically as a fertiliser in Malaysia had been low. This may correlate with the inadequate awareness of the chemical component of bat guano and benefits of bat guano in plant growth.

CHEMICAL COMPONENTS OF BAT GUANO

Recent studies on chemical components of guano worldwide provide clear justifications on the usage of guano as organic fertilisers. High levels of organic matter, total N, P (in the form of phosphate), K and carbon (C) were reported in a number of literatures such as Studier et al. (1994), Sridhar et al. (2006), Emerson and Roark (2007), Buliga (2010), Shetty et al. (2013), Richard et al. (2014), Jayasvasti and Jayasvasti (2018), Ünal et al. (2018), Oo et al. (2019), Misra et al. (2019), and Ferreira (2019). Most of these studies also mentioned the presence of other micronutrients in guano such as calcium (Ca), magnesium (Mg), aluminium (Al), iron and sulphur (S) that facilitate in controlling the pH of soil. Other than that, guano is composed of microbes from various bacterial taxa majorly from Enterococcaceae and Bacillaceae families (Newman et al., 2018). The presence of these microbes might be able to help with nutrient absorption of plants, clearing any soil toxins as well as controlling fungi and nematodes to avoid plant diseases (Shetty et al., 2013; Oo et al., 2019). This can be proven by a study reported by Shetty et al. (2013) where the usage of autoclaved soils with guano still showed the best growth, making guano a suitable candidate for biofertilisers.

However, the composition of guano is dependent on the age of guano, the bats' locality, diet, and species (Studier et al., 1994; Ferreira & Martins, 1999; Emerson & Roark, 2007; Vandzurova et al., 2012; Shetty et al., 2013; Karagoz, 2014; Jayasvasti & Jayasvasti, 2018; Newman et al., 2018; Ferreira, 2019). Study by Sakoui et al. (2020) supports the fact that the composition of guano is dependent on the age of guano as higher level of P, Al and iron are found in fresh guano than in guano found at deep layer of cave floors. Wurster et al. (2015) also showed that different levels of elements were found on bat guano with increasing depths. Analysis of results from the study shows a high C and N levels at the surface of bat guano collected at every locality. However, both C and N levels in the bat guano decreased with depths, hinting that the age of bat guano will influence on both C and N percentages (Wurster et al., 2015).

Other than that, P percentage of the bat guano in each locality was found to differ where the bat guano at Batu Cave and Makangit Cave were analysed to be at low levels, while bat guano obtained from Gomantong and Gangub Cave have moderate levels of P. Meanwhile, P percentage of samples obtained in Niah National Park were the highest among others (Wurster et al., 2015). Differences in guano composition amongst various insectivorous bats species can be observed through studies by Misra et al. (2019). Composition of the sodium (Na) and potassium (K) levels of the insectivorous bats Scotophilus kuhlii is recorded to be higher in its guano, which suggested that it consumes a considerable number of lepidopteran insects. Other than that, P content in the insectivorous bats Megaderma lyra measure to be at the highest percentage among all the species tested (Misra et al., 2019).

Comparison of guano composition among different diets has been performed in several studies. Emerson and Roark (2007) studies on the comparison between the guano of sanguivorous bat, *Desmodus rotundus* and frugivorous bat, *Pteropus rodricensis*. In this study, it was discovered that the sanguivorous bats have a higher level of C compared to the frugivorous bats, which may be related to the indigestible fruit components consumed by the frugivorous bat that was not included in fecal matter (Emerson & Roark, 2007). Studies by Studier *et al.* (1994), mentioned that the insectivorous or omnivorous bats possessed a higher level of N in comparison to herbivorous (frugivorous) bats. While, P content, on the other hand, shown to be at a higher level in frugivorous bats than in insectivorous bats (Goveas *et al.*, 2006; Emerson & Roark, 2007). These statements are supported by Sridhar *et al.* (2006) who reported that the guano of insectivorous bats, *Hipposideros speoris* showed a higher N percentage than P.

Old guano piles observed in Racer Cave by McFarlane and Lundberg (2018), shows a pink coloured layer coverage on the guano pile that was identified by spectral analysis to be phosphate mineral. Spectral analysis of the extensive and stratified bat guano in Niah Cave revealed a fluorine material and nitrogen. Other analysis of the same samples uncovers a composition of oxygen (O), P and Ca as well as a trace component of Na, Al, S, chlorine (Cl) and Fe (Dykes, 2007; McFarlane & Lundberg, 2018). The dry weight of N content from guano collected at Deer Cave in Mulu National Park is said to be 0.076 g (McFarlane et al., 2017), where fresh guano from the Free-tailed bat obtained from the same cave was found to contain 7.6% level of N (McFarlane & Lundberg, 2018). The specific nutrient levels recorded by other studies are as shown in Table 1. Only the dietary properties of data from Sridhar et al. (2006) were specified while specification of other literatures were absent. Species identification of the data were not recorded in most study in Table 1, except for insectivorous bat guano by Sridhar et al. (2006)

PLANT GROWTH STUDY USING BAT GUANO

Discovering the specific levels of N, P, and K in the guano can be used to detect the growth differential in plant parts as well as enhancing crop production (Ferreira, 2019; Misra *et al.*, 2019). Supplying N in plants is said to increase leaf growth (Oo *et al.*, 2019). When N is paired with P, crop products will have an increase of root growth and dry matter as well as improvement on roots to shoot ratio (Oelhalf, 1978; Poliquit & Calong, 2018). P component in manure will also enhance fruit quality and facilitate in the plants' disease resistance (Walan, 2013; Jayasvasti & Jayasvasti, 2018). Available P in plants is required for maturity of crops and seed formation (Linn & Myint, 2018). An important factor to note is that the size of grains and seeds is dependent on the levels of K absorbed by the plants. Oo *et al.* (2019) mentioned that K facilitates a stronger stem growth, water movement in plants as well as promotes fruiting and flowering of plants. Its deficiency would cause shrivelled fruits and

seeds of plants (Linn & Myint, 2018). Other important components in plant regulators are enzymes as well as Ca and Mg substances. These components will stimulate soil microorganisms in releasing nutrients at a constant which will lead to an easier nutrient absorption for the plants (Yankova *et al.*, 2016).

Table 1. Nutrient levels of bat	guano components from	previous studies (nr: n	ot recorded)

	Locality	Nitrogen (%)	Phosphorus (%)	Potassium (%)	Other Nutrients
Sridhar et al. (2006)					
High phosphorus guano	India	11 - 15	65 - 79	11 - 20	nr
(Frugivorous bats)					
High nitrogen guano		62 - 68	16 - 31	8 - 16	nr
(Insectivorous bats: H.					
speoris)					
Altintas et al. (2005)	Turkey	0.97 - 5.60	1.20 - 1.50	0.25 - 0.63	OM: 24 - 79
Karagoz- Sezer and	Turkey	8.20	P ₂ O ₅ : 2.00	K ₂ O: 0.5	OM: 67.30 %
Hanaya (2020)					C/N: 8-15/1
					pH: 4.00
					Salinity: 1.30 %
Giurgiu and Tamas	Romania	5 - 10	25	nr	nr
(2013)					
Sothearen et al. (2014)	Cambodia	9.97	3.4	0.4	nr
Suwarno and Idris	Indonesia	7 - 17	8 - 15	1.5 - 2.5	nr
(2007)					
Yankova <i>et al.</i> (2016)	Bulgaria	2	nr	nr	OM: 20 %
					pH: 4.2 - 6.3

Numerous plant growth studies that applied guano as organic fertilisers had recorded a positive output. A study conducted by Poliquit and Calong (2018) was done on the application of guano with garden soil in different ratios as treatment for carrot growth. The study shows several differences when compared to the nontreated soil. A longer and broader circumference of carrots roots was obtained, a more balanced nutrient accumulation of N and P was measured and a better respond in crop growth and development was recorded as well as a more uniformed N unleashed to promote root growth was observed (Poliquit & Calong, 2018).

Other than that, a study by Linn and Myint (2018) recorded an increase in soil nutrients (pH, moisture, N levels, available P and K, exchangeable K, Ca, and Mg) when a mixture of guano, wood ash, and sesame meal was applied on cassava plants when compared to the commercial organic fertiliser (VedagroTM). Cassava plants treated with the guano mixture also yielded a higher tuber length of cassava

compared to the other treatments. Nutrient levels of the cassava plant with guano mixture treatment were also found to have a higher value of protein, fat and fibre (Linn & Myint, 2018).

A study conducted by Sothearen et al. (2014), on application of guano on five economically important plant species recorded impressive results. A significant weekly increase of stem circumference and height were measured for all plant species treated with guano in comparison to the control treatment. When compared to chemical fertilisers treatments, three out of five plants with guano as fertilisers showed a better growth performance despite a lower NPK content of guano. This may prove that the presence of micronutrients and beneficial microflora that was not found in chemical fertilisers played a significant role in the effects of plant growth performance by guano (Sothearen et al., 2014). Introduction of guano throughout the study contributes to significant changes on the nutritional content of soil which automatically improves the growth of plants

(Sothearen et al., 2014).

An experiment by Ünal et al. (2018) also proved that the usage of guano on plants had increased growth compared to control. Other studies that support the claim are Shetty et al. (2013), Almohammedi et al. (2014) and Diba et al. (2013). Higher growth levels and improvements of plant growth were notably exhibited in all plant species that were treated with guano where a significant difference was statistically measured when compared to chemical fertilisers (Sakoui et al., 2020). Furthermore, bat guano is also essential as it supplies nutrition for microfloral growth (Misra et al., 2019).

Shetty et al. (2013) suggested that incorporation of different proportions of guano with high N as manures could give off a better plant growth performance. Nevertheless, in previous studies conducted, it was reported that only a little amount of guano should be applied to affect the plant growth (Sridhar et al., 2006; Shetty et al., 2013; Sothearen et al., 2014). A review from previous studies on the application of guano on plant growth shows that the guano can be used as a treatment in various state. Poliquit and Calong (2018), Shetty et al. (2013) and Sothearen et al. (2014) applied guano as fertiliser by a mixture with soil while, Ünal et al. (2018) applied the guano as a water mixture through drip irrigation method. Other studies on the other hand, placed the guano treatment with other organic waste such as Diba et al. (2013) where the guano was mixed with soybean paste, and Linn and Myint (2018), where guano treatment was mixed with wood ash, and sesame meal before applying as fertiliser. The method and mixture of guano application might give out a variable in plant growth, however a clear study with constant variable were not found to justify the matter.

A study conducted by Ojobor and Egbuchua (2021) informed that the appropriate mixture of bat guano with other manures can control nutrient deficiencies of crops. Furthermore, the suitable percentage of its chemical components, for instance, N, P and K, will undoubtedly enhance the plant structure from its shoot length, leaves, flowers, disease resistance and many more. Additionally, Karagoz-Sezer and Hanaya (2020) mentioned that studies on the influence and effect of guano on plant growth performance

showed that positive improvement of soil productivity as well as nutrient availability in soils are expected to be obtained with continuous and sustainable usage of guano.

CONCLUSION

Organic fertilisers had highlighted multiple advantageous effects throughout its years of usage. Although the era of sustainable farming has developed multiple organic fertilisers, the application of cave bat guano in Sarawak particularly, on plant growth performance will become a pendulum of agriculture in the region. This is significant due to the accessibility of bat guano in multiple regions of Sarawak mentioned in previous studies such as in Niah National Park and Mulu National Park. With that, sustainable farming using bat guano carried out by secluded settlement is economically helpful towards lowincome household.

Most importantly opting for organic fertiliser such as bat guano, would fulfil the Sustainable Development Goals proposed by the United Nations considering the promotion of several goals such as supply of clean water and sanitation (Goal 6), combating climate change (Goal 13) and conserving the ocean life (Goal 14) (International Fertiliser Association, 2020). This is particularly due to the low amount of toxic run-off to nearby water reservoir provided by bats guano as fertiliser as opposed to chemical fertilisers, which can create a safer water supply to houses and living developments. Other than that, the ecological benefits of bats guano usage as fertiliser in minimising greenhouse effects from its carbon storing characteristics is a valuable outcome to the environment.

The expediency of utilising bats guano on plant growth through the research mentioned throughout this review, it is evident that bat guano is expected to be an effective alternative to chemical fertilisers and would decrease the ecological impacts from chemical fertilisers that have been applied for decades. The chemical composition of bat guano as studied vastly in previous works showed an exemplary nutrient content of bat guano as an organic fertiliser. These reviews with relation to the exploration of bat guano effects on various plant types created a value added for usage of the material in agriculture. Application of bat guano as an organic fertiliser is found to be more beneficial, particularly, for soils with low organic matter content. Lastly, the chemical composition study of bat guano should be continued and expanded to achieve a deeper understanding of its application in agriculture.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors wish to thank Centre of Pre-University Studies as well as Faculty of Resource Science and Technology, Universiti Malaysia Sarawak, for the assistance and support provided during the research. This study was made possible through Fundamental Research Grant Scheme provided by the Ministry of Higher Education Malaysia (Grant number: FRGS/1/2019/WAB01/ UNIMAS/03/4). Thank you to Miss Melisa Malini a/p Raja Gopal from Faculty of Language and Communication for her revision of the article.

REFERENCES

- Almohammedi, A.N., Almehemdi, A.F. & Al Ajeelee, R.K. (2014). Impact of bat guano Otonycteris hemprichii Camd and seaweed extract on some growth and yield traits of baraka seed Nigella sativa L. Journal of Biology, Agriculture and Healthcare, 4(1): 57-65.
- Altintas, A. & Yildiz, G. (2005). Mineral levels of bat guano. Veterinary Journal of Ankara University, 52(1): 1-5.
- Assefa S. & Tadesses, S. (2019). The principal role of organic fertiliser on soil properties and agricultural productivity- a review. Agricultural Research and Technology: Open Access Journal, 22(2): 46-50. DOI: 10.19080/ARTOAJ.2019.22 .556192
- Bass, M.S., Finer, M., Jenkins, C.N., Kreft, H., Cisneros-Heredia, D.F., McCracken, S.F. & Kunz, T.H. (2010). Global conservation significance of Ecuador's Yasuní National Park. *Public Library of Science ONE*, 5(1). DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone .0008767
- Bender, D.J., Contreras, T.A. & Fahrig, L. (1998).
 Habitat loss and population decline: A metaanalysis of the patch size effect. *Ecology*, 79(2): 517-533. DOI: 10.1890/0012-9658(1998)079 [0517:HLAPDA]2.0.CO;2
- Bird, M.I., Boobyer, E.M., Bryant, C., Lewis, H.A., Paz, V. & Stephens, W.E. (2007). A long record of environmental change from bat guano deposits in

Makangit Cave, Palawan, Philippines. *Earth and Environmental Science Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh*, 98(1): 59-69. DOI: 10.1017 /S1755691007000059

- Buliga, C. (2010). Guano exploitation in Madagascar.
 Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection. 904.
 Retrieved June 29, 2023 from https://digitalcol lections.sit.edu/isp_collection/904
- Demirtas, E.I., Nuri, A.R.I., Arpacioğlu, A., Harun, K.A.Y.A. & Ozkan, C.F. (2005). Chemical properties of different organic manures. *Derim.* 22(2): 47-52.
- Diba, P.F., Susatyo, E.B. & Pratjojo, W. (2013). Enhancement of N, P and K levels in liquid organic fertiliser using bat guano. *Indonesian Journal of Chemical Science*, 2(1): 95-101.
- Dykes, A.P. (2007). Mass movements in cave sediments: Investigation of a~ 40,000-year-old guano mudflow inside the entrance of the Great Cave of Niah, Sarawak, Borneo. *Landslides*, 4(3): 279-290. DOI: 10.1007/s10346-006-0077-5
- Emerson, J.K. & Roark, A.M. (2007). Composition of guano produced by frugivorous, sanguivorous, and insectivorous bats. *Acta Chiropterologica*, 9(1): 261-267. DOI: 10.3161/1733-5329(2007)9 [261:COGPBF]2.0.CO;2
- Fenton, M.B. & Simmons, N.B. (2015). *Bats: A world of science and mystery*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Fernandez, N., Viciana, V. & Drovandi, A. (2003). Assessment of the total environmental impact of agrochemicals in the Mendoza river basin. Spain: Organization of Ibero-American States.
- Ferreira, R.L. & Martins, R.P. (1999). Trophic structure and natural history of bat guano invertebrate communities, with special reference to Brazilian caves. *Tropical Zoology*, 12(2): 231-252. DOI: 10.1080/03946975.1999.10539391
- Ferreira, R.L. (2019). Guano communities. Encyclopedia of caves (pp. 474-484). Academic Press. DOI: 10.1016/B978-0-12-814124-3.0 0057-1
- Ghanem, S.J. & Voigt, C.C. (2012). Increasing awareness of ecosystem services provided by bats. Advances in the Study of Behavior, 44: 279-302. DOI: 10.1016/B978-0-12-394288-3.00007-1
- Giurgiu, A. & Tămaş, T. (2013). Mineralogical data on bat guano deposits from three Romanian caves. *Studia Universitatis Babes-Bolyai Geologia*,

58(2), 13-18. DOI:10.5038/1937-8602.58.2.2

- Goveas, S.W., Miranda, E.C., Seena, S. & Sridhar, K.R. (2006). Observations on guano and bolus of Indian flying fox, *Pteropus giganteus*. *Current Science*, 90(2), 160-162.
- Grantina-Ievina, L. & Ievinsh, G. (2015). Microbiological characteristics and effect on plants of the organic fertiliser from vermicompost and bat guano. In *Annual 21st International Scientific Conference: Research for Rural Development.* pp. 95-101.
- Harris, J.A. (1970). Bat-guano cave environment. Science, 169(3952): 1342-1343. DOI: 10.1126/ science.169.3952.1342.c
- Hua, L., Wu, W., Liu, Y., McBride, M.B., & Chen, Y. (2009). Reduction of nitrogen loss and Cu and Zn mobility during sludge composting with bamboo charcoal amendment. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 16(1), 1-9. DOI: 10.1007/s 11356-008-0041-0
- Hutchinson, G.E. (1950). Survey of contemporary knowledge of biogeochemistry 3. The biogeochemistry of vertebrate excretion. *Bulletin* of the American Museum of Natural History, 96.
- International Fertiliser Association (2020). The SDGs and sustainable fertiliser production. https:// www.fertiliser.org/Public/Sustainability/SDGs/P ublic/Sustainability/SDGs.aspx?hkey=beaa00d3-813a-41f1-a4d0-2868855e85e4
- Jayasvasti, I. & Jayasvasti, M. (2018). Bat guano as the component of fertiliser or the health hazard? *Southeast Asian Journal of Tropical Medicine and Public Health*, 49(2): 331-339.
- Karagoz, K. (2014). Bat guano in agricultural production. *Alinteri Zirai Bilimler Dergisi*, 27, 35-42.
- Karagoz-Sezer, K. & Hanay, A. (2020) Effect of bat guano on cation exchange capacity, some macro nutrient content and reaction of soil (pH). *Atatürk Üniversitesi Ziraat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 51(2): 140-144. doi: 10.17097/ataunizfd.607312
- Kasso, M. & Balakrishnan, M. (2013). Ecological and economic importance of bats (Order Chiroptera). *International Scholarly Research Notices*, 2013(187415): 1-9. DOI: 10.1155/2013/187415
- Kincheloe, S. (1983). Fertilizer minerals. *Industrial Minerals and Rock*, (1): 233-241.
- Kingston, T., Zubaid, A., Lim, G. & Hatta, F. (2006).

From research to outreach: Environmental education materials for the bats of Malaysia. In Yahya, N.A., Philip, E. and Ong, T. (eds.) *Proceedings of the Best of Both Worlds International Conference on Environmental Education for Sustainable Development* 2005. Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. FRIM.

- Linn, K.Z. & Myint, P.P. (2018). Study on the effectiveness of natural organic fertilisers on cassava (*Manihot esculenta* Crantz.) cultivation. *Asian Journal of Soil Science and Plant Nutrition*, 3(3): 1-10. DOI: 10.9734/AJSSPN/2018/42912
- McFarlane, D.A., Lundberg, J. & Rentergem, G.V. (2017). Preliminary observations on tropical bat caves as biogeochemical nitrogen sinks. *Proceedings of the 17th International Congress of* Speleology, 157-160.
- McFarlane, D.A. & Lundberg, J. (2018). New records of guano-associated minerals from caves in northwestern Borneo. *International Journal of Speleology*, 47(2): 119-126. DOI:10.5038/1827-806X.47.2.2169
- Misra, P.K., Gautam, N.K. & Elangovan, V. (2019). Bat guano: A rich source of macro and microelements essential for plant growth. *Annals* of *Plant and Soil Research*, 21(1): 82-86.
- Newman, M.M., Kloepper, L.N., Duncan, M., McInroy, J.A. & Kloepper, J.W. (2018). Variation in bat guano bacterial community composition with depth. *Frontiers in Microbiology*, 9(914): 1-9. DOI: 10.3389/fmicb.2018.00914
- Nguyen, D.H.V., Nguyen, N.T., Nguyen, T.V., Huang, J.C.C. & Kingston, T. (2015). In Economic Value and Challenges of Harvesting Guano Fertilizer from Bat Houses in the MeKong Delta, Vietnam 3rd International Southeast Asian Bat Conference, 14-17 August 2015, Kuching, Sarawak, Malaysia.
- Nowak, R.M. (1994). *Walker's bats of the world*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.
- Oelhalf, C.R. (1978). Organic matter. Allanhold Osman and Co. Publisher.
- Ojobor, S.A. & Egbuchua, C.N. (2021). Influence of formulated palm mill effluent and bat guano mixture on maize performance and soil chemical properties in Delta State, Nigeria. *Indian Journal of Agricultural Research*, 56(1): 28-32.
- Oo, A.L., Khine, T.M. & Aye, T.T. (2019). Preparation and characterization of organic fertilisers made from bat guano, rice husk ash and

groundnut leaves. *Journal Myanmar Academy of Arts and Sciences*, 17(1B): 393-405.

- Poliquit, D. & Calong, E. (2018). Bat guano levels of application influencing carrot (*Daucus carota* L.) growth and yield performance. *Countryside Development Research Journal*, 6(1): 23-29.
- Richards, R., Brigida, D., DiMiceli, C., Gersh, K., Sribarra, A. & Iweins, M. (2014). *IUCN SSC Guidelines for minimizing the negative impact to bats and other cave organisms from guano harvesting.* Gland: IUCN.
- Sakoui, S., Derdak, R., Addoum, B., Serrano-Delgado, A., Soukri, A. & El Khalfi, B. (2020). The life hidden inside caves: Ecological and economic importance of bat guano. *International Journal of Ecology*, 2020: 1-7. DOI: 10.1 155/2020/9872532
- Shetty, S., Sreepada, K.S. & Bhat, R. (2013). Effect of bat guano on the growth of *Vigna radiata* L. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 3(3): 1-8.
- Simmons, N.B. & Voss, R.S. (1998). The mammals of Paracou, French Guiana, a Neotropical lowland rainforest fauna. Part 1, Bats. *Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History*, 237.
- Sothearen, T., Furey, N.M. & Jurgens, J.A. (2014). Effect of bat guano on the growth of five economically important plant species. *Journal of Tropical Agriculture*, 52(2): 169-173.
- Sridhar, K.R., Ashwini, K.M., Seena, S. & Sreepada, K.S. (2006). Manure qualities of guano of insectivorous cave bat *Hipposideros speoris*. *Tropical and Subtropical Agroecosystems*, 6(2): 103-110.
- Studier, E.H., Sevick, S.H., Keeler, J.O. & Schenck, R.A. (1994). Nutrient levels in guano from maternity colonies of big brown bats. *Journal of Mammalogy*, 75(1): 71-83. DOI: 10.2307/1382237
- Suwarno & Idris, K. (2007). Potential and possibility of direct use of guano as fertiliser in Indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmu Tanah dan Lingkungan*, 9(1): 37-43.
- Tan, C.S., Noni, V., Sathiya Seelan, J.S., Denel, A. & Anwarali Khan, F.A. (2021). Ecological surveillance of bat coronaviruses in Sarawak, Malaysian Borneo. *BMC Research Notes*, 14(1): 1-6. DOI: 10.1186/s13104-021-05880-6
- Thampan, P.K. (1993). Organics in soil health and crop production. France: Peekay Tree Crops

Development Foundation.

- Torres-Jiménez, M.G., Murrieta-Galindo, R., Bolívar-Cimé, B., Wojtarowski-Leal, A. & Piñar-Álvarez, M.Á. (2020). Coffee farmers' perception of bat guano as fertiliser in agroecosystems of Mexico. *Regions and Cohesion*, 10(1): 22-35. DOI: 10.3167/ reco.2020.100103
- Tuttle, M.D. & Moreno, A. (2005). *Cave-dwelling* bats of Northern Mexico: Their value and conservation needs. Texas: Bat Conservation International.
- Ünal, M., Can, O., Can, B.A. & Poyraz, K. (2018). The effect of bat guano applied to the soil in different forms and doses on some plant nutrient contents. *Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis*, 49(6): 708-716. DOI: 10.1080 /00103624.2018.1434540
- Vandzurova, A., Pilis, V., Backor, P., Judova, J., Javorsky, P., Faix, S.P.P. & Pristas, P. (2012). Microflora of the bat guano. *Folia Veterinaria*, 56(2): 68-69.
- Voigt, C.C. & Kingston, T. (2016). Bats in the Anthropocene: Conservation of bats in a changing World. Springer Nature.
- Walan, P. (2013). Modeling of peak phosphorus: A study of bottlenecks and implications for future production. (Master Thesis), Uppsala University, Sweden.
- Ware, R.L., Garrod, B., Macdonald, H. & Allaby, R.G. (2020). Guano morphology has the potential to inform conservation strategies in British bats. *Public Library of Science ONE*, 15(4). DOI: 10.13 71/journal.pone.0230865
- Wasti, I.G., Khan, F.A.A., Bernard, H., Hassan, N.H., Fayle, T. & Sathiya Seelan, J.S. (2021). Fungal communities in bat guano, speleothem surfaces, and cavern water in Madai cave, Northern Borneo (Malaysia). *Mycology*, 12(3): 188-202. DOI: 10. 1080/21501203.2021.1877204
- Wurster, C.M., Munksgaard, N., Zwart, C. & Bird, M. (2015). The biogeochemistry of insectivorous cave guano: A case study from insular Southeast Asia. *Biogeochemistry*, 124(1): 163-175. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0230865
- Wurster, C.M., Rifai, H., Zhou, B., Haig, J. & Bird, M.I. (2019). Savanna in equatorial Borneo during the late Pleistocene. *Scientific Reports*, 9(1): 1-7. DOI: 10.1038/s41598-019-42670-4

Yankova, P., Naskova, P., Malcheva, B. & Plamenov,

D. (2016). Impact of the biological fertilisers on the microorganisms and the nutrient elements in

the soil. International Journal of Current Research, 8: 39681-39686.